

Combating Anti-Asian Hate

Session Description: Stop AAPI Hate collected 10,370 reports of hate incidents from March 19, 2020 to September 30, 2021. From the brutal attack of a 65-year-old Filipino woman in New York to the Georgia shooting where six Asian women were killed, the AAPI community has endured vicious and senseless attacks. Asian and Asian American college students have also been victims of bullying, online harassment, and verbal assault and have endured racist and xenophobic comments or accusations of bringing diseases from China to the U.S. Overt and covert anti-Asian racism and violence have long existed in schools and higher education institutions—and have only been exacerbated by the COVID-19 pandemic. The rise in anti-Asian hate is not only a pandemic-related phenomenon, but part of a longer trend of increasing racially-motivated hate against Asian Americans and an increase in race-motivated hate crimes experienced by all groups. Speakers will discuss strategies for combating anti-Asian hate and how data can inform policy making. A new data dashboard containing longitudinal hate crime data for Los Angeles County will be presented. The discussion will also focus on potential solutions involving mental health services and counseling, reconciliation programs, the expansion of hate incident/crime reporting, future research needs on anti-Asian hate, and collaboration between local governments, schools, businesses, and community-based organizations.

Moderator: Karen Umemoto

Professor in the Departments of Urban Planning and Asian American Studies and the Helen and Morgan Chu Chair of the Asian American Studies Center at UCLA

Researcher: Maggie Seay

Masters Graduate Student of Urban and Regional Planning at UCLA's Luskin School of Public Affairs

Researcher: Robin Toma

Executive Director of the Los Angeles County Human Relations Commission

Researcher: Rob Teranishi

Professor of Social Science and Comparative Education, the Morgan and Helen Chu Endowed Chair in Asian American Studies, and Director for the Institute for Immigration, Globalization, and Education at UCLA

Community Reactor: Manju Kulkarni

Executive Director of AAPI Equity Alliance (AAPI Equity), Co-founder Stop AAPI Hate

Policy Reactor: Asm. Al Muratsuchi

California Assemblymember representing the 66th Assembly District, located in the South Bay of Los Angeles County

Please visit <https://www.aasc.ucla.edu/aapipolicy/default.aspx> to view the researchers' policy briefs.

A. Organization

- Karen Umemoto - Director of AAS Center
- Seay and Toma: demonstrate a Tableau dashboard, Teranishi, Manju, Muratsuchi
- Seay: So we're presenting on the longitudinal trends of hate crimes targeting Asian Americans and Pacific Islanders from 2012 to 2020. Based on data provided by the commissioner on human relations, we updated this presentation, the 2021 data, but the policy brief that's associated with the event today only goes to 2020
- Toma: Let me just say that our commission is part of the LA county government, which is over the 88 cities of LA County. And we've been doing the collecting hate crime data for over forty years. Even before there were laws on the books that would enhance deputies for violators. It's a really great tool that I think everyone at UCLA Asian American Studies center is a great resource that you all can use. This, what we're seeing now is a dashboard that really collects just so much of the data that really took a lot of blood, sweat and tears to get from law enforcement agencies, as well as community partners. I think it's a really great tool. And I think, Karen and Maggie and everyone, UCLA Study Center, and others who have really, to put this together as a great resource that I hope will use.

- Seay: So we'll have a QR code at the end of this entire panel so people can access this but it is publicly available at [UCLA research.com/data](https://ucla-research.com/data) and I just wanted to give a quick demonstration of the dashboard. This is it and then we'll get into some of the longitudinal trends around anti-Asian hate specifically. So this again shows data from 2003 to 2021.
 - Offers folks the ability to look at subsets of the data
 - For example: Gender based crimes and the rest of the data is going to sort of interact with these selections so you can sort of drill into areas that you might be interested in learning more about, seeing how trends change over time, how different motivations intersect with victim gender identity, location of crimes, the type of offense or the rates of violence, you can look specifically to target groups, sort of wherever your interests take you.
 - The Commission does a great job of cleaning through the data looking at it case by case and identifying specific language or something that or vandalism or symbol that's used during the crime. And will attach some motivations or special characteristics to the data,
 - for example, white supremacy so if you're interested in looking specifically at some of those, some motivations or special characteristics that are added, you can drill further into that.
 - And then if you're also interested in looking specifically at one year, or getting more context around, something that's not necessarily provided in the dashboard. The commission has annual reports that provide context year over year for all the current data from that year.
- Toma: I'll just add that some of the data you won't find in the state of California report or FBI report
 - We decided many years ago to look particularly at certain issues like the markings of white supremacists' involvement in hate crimes. We also identify whether there's been criminal street gang involvement in hate crimes or whether there's anti-immigrant remarks in hate crimes of those are some of the ways in which you won't find similar data in the state or federal hate crime reports.
- Seay: trends
 - Okay, so now we'll come back and look at the trends that we identified over time for AGI targeted hate crimes from 2012 to 2021.
 - So the first graph that we're looking at on the top are all racially motivated hate crimes and on the bottom are specifically API targeted hate crimes in LA County, and we can see the sharp increase in the number of crimes in 2020 and 2021, but we also noticed that these trends these upward trends began before the pandemic
- Toma:
 - To quickly add that, you know, these numbers of course, even though they were the last four years, reported hate crimes in LA County...2020 point of view was 67% increase over the previous year. And that's the largest number we've ever documented in our annual report.
 - At the same time, it's important to note that this is serious underreporting, because we know FBI studies and DOJ studies have shown that hate crimes that are actually reported by individuals usually are at least twice as many as reported to the FBI. We know that for Asian Americans, in particular, that there's cultural and linguistic barriers...immigration status could be reasons why...unfamiliarity with the criminal justice system, and just fear that reporting hate crimes is gonna bring unwanted publicity or retaliation.
 - I did want to also point out that the pandemic, specifically named in hate crimes against Asians, is about one of every four hate crimes.

- Seay - Second graph: fed, state, and LA County all show a sharp rise in reported AAPI targeted hate crime in 2020
 - This next graph shows that these upward trends are mirrored at the state and the federal level. So on the bottom we see the anti-Asian hate crimes for LA County. In the middle we see anti-Asian hate crimes recorded at the state of California through the Department of Justice. And then at the top we see anti-Asian hate crimes that are aggregated at the federal level.
- Toma:
 - Yeah, this is kind of sad in the sense that you know, I think, in Los Angeles County. We have long been ahead of most of the places in terms of the diversity that we have, as well as working in, collaborating with community and government around hate crimes. But what you see here is that their forces obviously well beyond our control and obviously it wasn't just the pandemic, because, as you pointed out and started before.
 - I think that's because we're talking about previous years where there's already been a lot of targeting and discussion about China as being the trade enemy. So now instead of agents being the enemy in wars, it's been the target of economic warfare in a sense, and of course, that's true back right back to the '80s when we saw a Vincent Chin murdered because of angry auto workers who were blaming Japan, for the job losses in the American auto industry. So these are issues that tell us that, really, it's important to not believe that with the end of a pandemic or the reduction in the restrictions we're experiencing that we're also gonna see the agenda.
 - You can just tell by the recent, balloon controversy, which really ties back to other public issues around Huawei and the tariffs against Chinese goods by American campaign...that it's going to continue to be a threat, to keep anti-Asian hate high unfortunately,
- Seay - 3rd Graph: anti-immigrant slurs or other explicit indications of anti-immigrant motivations rose 453% between 2012 and 2021
 - As Robin mentioned, the Commission looks specifically at crimes and when there are anti-immigrant slurs or anti-immigrant language present during the committing of the crime, they assign sort of a sub-motivation of anti-immigrant to that crime. So we can see that anti-immigrant crimes rose 453% from 2012 to 2021, For all racially motivated crimes.
 - The line that is in purple is specifically the anti API, crimes with anti-immigrant language present. So between these two graphs, we can see how this these two upward trends are actually working sort of in tandem with one another
 - Toma:
 - And for LA County data, like the most recent four year reporting, of all the anti-Asian hate crimes, nearly 1/3 included slurs, and I think that represents of course, targeting immigrants that is also a constant in human history. But certainly, again, we're no different here in LA County, California. So that's an area where I think that it points to the need to really pay attention to the anti-immigrant scapegoating that occurs. Obviously the difference there is the anti-Latino Anti-Mexican scapegoating is also present, largely in the overall crime numbers.
 - Seay: 4th: Race of suspects for API targeted hate crimes
 - There was a sharp rise in white suspects committing crimes against API victims in 2020 and 2021

- Toma: Just to point out that, this is a marker that we have been showing, the rise of white nationalism through the growth in white nationalist groups, but also, the number of white supremacists markings and hate crimes ends up being about one in six of all hate crimes reported in LA county, which you wouldn't think in this county that you would have such a high number of white supremacists, markings and hate crimes, but that's an understatement because there could be many cases of activity where they're not openly stating the white supremacist. All of this is an understatement, depending on people, explicitly saying, we're admitting during the actual commission of the crime that that's a motivation
 - And I would just say that another important point about this is that there's a common perception because of what's been shown in social media that African Americans or blacks are the leading suspects or the perpetrators of hate crimes against Asians. and the numbers here actually counter that, in LA County and over the pandemic period, we have seen that African Americans are not the largest group, it's whites that comprise the largest criminal suspects in anti-Asian hate crimes
 - Seay 5th graph: (proportion of crimes taking place in public places and businesses increased substantially in 2019, 2020, and 2021)
 - This graph looks at the locations of API targeted hate crimes in LA County and we can see a sharp rise in crime taking place in public places, particularly in 2019, 2020, and 2021. And then also a rise in 2020 and 2021 of crimes taking place at businesses.
 - Toma: and I think this is also indicative of an overall trend in those who are committing acts of hate, are being very brazen and open about it, that there seems to be an empowerment of white communities in particular, to target Asians in public places. And that's a shift from the previous period. We know that there's been plenty of comments by the administration, by the Trump administration around targeting China, specifically calling Kung Flu and the China virus. and we've seen it also in public transportation, for example, which we've looked at specifically, there's actually a doubling the five-year average of those crimes, transportation, and that something that we think is another sign of sort of the openness and boldness of those who think that hate is okay in our communities.
 - Seay: 6th: rate of violent crimes increased in last decade for all racially-motivated crimes, including crimes that targeted AAPI-victims
 - We've seen that the rate of violent crimes has increased in the last decade for all racially motivated crimes, including crimes that target Asian Americans and Pacific Islanders. Here we can see that the number of simple assaults has sharply increased since 2009 compared to aggravated assault, intimidation, vandalism, and disorderly conduct which make up the sort of top five types of offenses and these and these crimes.
 - Toma: And you know, this is kind of ironic, just because we know the level of violence has just increased overall. But it is specifically true that for LA County, anti-Asian hate crimes have really hit one of the highest levels ever - 81% of all the anti-Asian incidents were violent, which is larger than the rate of violence for racial crimes in general, and certainly for hate crimes in general. So, and for the first time, Asian Americans are targeted higher than the rate of the population, about 50% of LA County's population is Asian and about 60% of the racial hate crimes are against Asians, so these are really unfortunate signs.
 - **Seay: What do these trends mean?**
 - First that the Rise in AAPI hate is not just a COVID phenomenon - started much earlier

- This increase in racial violence more broadly since 2012 we think might contribute to this undercurrent of racial animus that sort of set the stage for the service surge of violence that we saw, post 2020 as part of the pandemic and may signal growing tensions within the county and potentially elsewhere.
- Toma: There are a lot of explanations for this one is that,
 - Overall increase in anti-immigrant rhetoric: clearly there has been overall partisan rhetoric that is not only targeting Asians, people coming from Asia, but also south of the border. So you combine those two policies and the kinds of remarks that are coming from the highest levels, and that feeds the anti-immigrant scapegoating in the data.
 - We're also seeing that, you know, what's been made clear is that our public education system isn't inclusive of the histories of Asian Americans and Latinos in the US history classes in world history classes.
 - Public education system isn't representative of Asian Americans and other minority groups: And also what's out there, Typically, media so that's a huge gap that contributes to continue to be ignorant about Asian Americans and other minority groups that are targeted, and then we have the clear polarization, that's happening, because of the widening economic divide in our country, and also about the continuing religious bigotry that we're seeing, as well as the political polarization
 - Clear polarization, religious bigotry, political polarization: that's happening because of the widening economic divide in our country, and also about the continuing religious bigotry that we're seeing, as well as the political polarization. January 6, you know, had its impact and probably most importantly, is energizing a sector of the American public, which believes that minorities are taking over the country and they need to reclaim it and claim it for the president for the former president.
 - George Floyd and the BLM movement - been a threat to those afraid of losing the racial majority in this country: And so that is also part of it, as well as of course, George Floyd and what happened with riots and the Black Lives Matter movement and, in fact, has been a threat to many of those who are already fearful about the status quo changing and losing the racial majority in this country.
 - Inadequate mental health and social services: And we know that you know, many hate crimes, we see that mental illness shows up as being a factor and we know that the pandemic has also contributed to a lot of challenges in terms of mental health. And so that, along with other threats to people's sense of security, when jobs are something that people when they start to see that threatened, they start to look for someone to blame and so that contributes to the targeting, as well the lack of mental health care
 - Ineffectiveness of current carceral approach to hate crime: And then the last is that and this is really important, you know, the way that we've been approaching it for many years as a society is every time that there's a rush of hate crimes, legislators will pass stricter laws with our sentences for those who committed the crimes. And what that does is to make people spend more time in our jail and prison systems, which if you have any familiarity with it is really rife with racialization and ends up strengthening or forcing people into being tied into racially violent groups and gangs.

- Recommendations: will be discussed at the end due to time constraints

Rob Teranishi - professor, Helen and Morgan Chu Chair at AAS Department, active in fighting against attacks on affirmative action in S. Court

- I want to start by thanking the Ca API and Legislative Caucus, of course UCLA, Asian American Studies Center for supporting this work
- The resources were important not only for academics for research, but also for bringing us together - having conversations across silos. We have a lot of disparate groups that are participating. And it's really nice to be able to have conversations across our silos, about these important issues
- My remarks today and actually build nicely on the prior presentation, on focus on education. And, specifically, my report focused on the need for more attention to Asian Americans when it comes to the broader commitment in our education system to Diversity Equity and social justice.
- So as many of you are aware, the verbal assaults, the destruction of property, the physical attacks against Asian Americans has been well documented. And of course, he saw that data earlier. Right. So we have this discussion about how we document these occurrences. But, you know, despite the many solidarity statements and calls for actions by college universities, this you know, we hear this all the time, right, as soon as an incident happens College University says, you know, we stand with our AAPI community. But you know, the same institutions often don't acknowledge that there's a long history of Asian Americans facing both overt and covert forms of racism in higher education.
- And so while there's been this kind of long standing issue facing Asian Americans relative to things like campus climate, the COVID pandemic has exacerbated the extent to which Asian and Asian American college students have been victims of bullying, online harassment and verbal assaults.
 - A recent example of course, is what we saw happen with a Indiana University College student.
 - In fact, as I was walking over from Lot 8 and I saw the bus coming on the campus and I was thinking about this young college student. She was like 20 years old. And you know, she's getting off the bus near campus, and a woman comes up behind her and stabs her in the back of the head. Right? And it's like, they asked the woman "Well, why do you do this?" [and she answered] "Because she's Chinese." And you know, even if it hasn't happened to me or to others in this room, it's something we keep in the back of our mind. right? I just mentioned like, as I was walking over from Lot 8, and I was thinking about that, right? So I mean, it's this feeling of not being safe.
- And this is something that affects us in education settings, it affects us in the workplace. And you know what? We want higher education not just to provide solidarity statements, but to actually engage with the Asian American community.
- What we focus on in the report:
 - The ways in which API students have unique experiences with discrimination and racial microaggressions lower levels of satisfaction and engagement and the implications of that for their educational trajectory.
 - And then their perceptions of institutional commitment. And support from their institutions.
- So we talked about some findings we have from a recent report we did at UCLA so this report was done pre pandemic, but it points to some issues around the climate. so it's a mixed method study at UCLA. And I looked at the experiences of Asian Americans and Pacific Islanders with the campus racial climate.

Findings:

- The first thing we found is that the racialized experiences of API students parallels other racial and ethnic minorities. So what this table shows is that our API students, along with their other racial minority counterparts, reported lower levels of a sense of belonging on campus.
 - Lower levels of satisfaction with their academic experience, compared to their white peers.
 - So this might seem like an intuitive finding. But it's actually important to document that Asian Americans and Pacific Islanders do indeed have the minoritized experience on campus, despite their proportional representation in the student body, or their presumptions that they're this like, model minority, or even the idea that they've achieved some honorary white status. So part of what we wanted to do in this research is just basically align Asian Americans and Pacific Islanders with their other minority counterparts.
 - When it comes to campus racial climate for API's, we also found that disaggregated data matters because it reveals important differences between data centers
 - The treatment of the population as a marginalized group is damaging, it's misleading, and it often leads to a lot of generalizations and assumptions, including the idea that API's do not warrant attention or resources relative to our goal of achieving equity, diversity, and social justice.
 - So we found that Southeast Asians reported a particularly high level of feeling dissatisfied with their academic and social experiences. And in our interviews, students talked about their concerns with the overgeneralization of Asian Americans as this kind of homogenous model minority group on campus.
 - And many of them found their greatest support actually from student organizations. There's actually a higher rate of participating in student orgs than any other group. And it is in those spaces where they actually garner the greatest support as opposed from like campus services and programs.
- K-12 Data -
 - We've done further research on racial climate issues for API's in K 12 schools. And this research also was pre pandemic and we use national data to actually do this analysis. And so we looked at this kind of national data on bullying and victimization in schools. And we found that well, Asian Americans report a lower rate of being bullied compared to other groups.

Findings:

 - When Asian Americans do experienced bullying, they're more likely than others to attribute it to their race or ethnic origin, okay so you got to think about like what bullying is right, it could be anything. It doesn't have to be a reason why the person is bullied.
 - Think about what bullying is right...But when it comes to Asian Americans, they are more likely to attribute that bullying attack because of their race or ethnic origin. So as we combat bullying and harassment in schools, right. We hear a lot in discussions about making our schools safer. We need to be mindful of the higher prevalence of bullying and harassment on the basis of race and ethnic origin when it comes to the Asian American community.
 - During the pandemic, I was getting a lot of calls from reporters saying, you know, how come Asian parents don't want to send their kids back to school in person. "Is it because they have elderly relatives that have to be taken care of at home? Or is it concerns about health, safety?"
 - And I said, "you know, some parents aren't feeling that safe about their kids even going back and forth to school. not to mention what the school climate itself has in terms of potential harm to their kids"

- And so that's what you got to talk to the families about is how they are feeling in terms of the extent to which schools are able to offer that kind of safe environment for their kids or even to reassure their parents that they're aware of these things happening. And when bullying happens against Asian Americans on there being targeted because of their race and ethnic origin.
- Another important finding is that Asian Americans who reported bullying were more likely than others to indicate that it had a negative impact on their schoolwork, their relationships with friends and family and their feelings about themselves. So if you think about the nature of the bullying that they're experiencing, its effect on Asian Americans' self-perception, their feelings about their identity. That data kind of makes sense.
 - brings me back to middle school, right? It's like this was like my experience of Middle School. Where, you know, the kinds of bullying I experienced, it was always because of like my race, and then I remember having a tough time talking to my family about it.
- Recommendations
 - Supporting Asians and Asian Americans must be a part of our commitment to diversity, equity, and inclusion
 - It is imperative to go beyond solidarity statements and listening sessions - campuses need to work with their API community to better understand them
 - There is a need for greater investment in ethnic studies - good for Asian Americans and entire campus community about communities of color, plays an important purpose
 - Imperative for colleges to use disaggregated data - to understand and help mitigate the ways that anti-Asian that has impacted different API subgroups
 - Needs to be greater attention to the physical safety AND unique emotional needs of Asian American students -
 - In the report I also talk about Asian students, our international students and I mean people can't tell the difference, but they also have unique challenges

Umemoto: Thank you Rob. I appreciate the presentation and I want to call out that one of the main limitations of data at higher jurisdiction levels is that they don't disaggregate Pacific Islanders and I think that's something that needs a lot more attention

Manjusha P. Kulkarni: AAPI Equity Alliance, partner of UCLA, co-dir. of Stop AAPI Hate

- Activity: Before I get started, I want to ask everyone to stand up:
 - First I want to thank Karen and her fabulous team
 - Second, they have been a long time member organization of AAPI Equity Alliance (one of the >40 community based organizations to represent the 1.6 million AAPI in LA County since 1975 and have more recently co-founded Stop AAPI Hate) - I'm also a lecturer here at UCLA
 - I want to say thank you for there's almost always one representative from AAPI Equity Alliance on all these panels and we bring a wealth of expertise and I wanted to call them out
 - I also wanted to say how honored I am to be on this panel:
 - Knew Muratsuchi: worked on Japanese Latin American Redress

also see Southeast Asians Philippines, Vietnamese individuals who are biracial and identify as both white as well as Asian American. What's not all this breakfast, South Asians are at about 2%, and even Pacific Islanders have experienced hate as well.

- Key takeaways:
 - Affects all AAPI groups - intersectionality matters
 - Whether you look at LA county #s or our numbers this is the tip of the iceberg -
 - AAPI data: ~12% our community members nationwide experience hate
 - Our study with the Eddleman Firm: 20%
 - Pew: 45% - 8-10 mill individuals
 - And then of course in this room we found it was 100%
 - Most are hate incidents and not hate crimes - really important when thinking about what solutions need - This is important in terms of what was shared previously, holding public institutions accountable, ensuring equity in all places in society - we know we don't need a one size fits all
 - Perpetrators come from all communities and they're not largely African American
 - Racism is not simply interpersonal - many are one-on-one, but we know that from the Texas legislation right now to prevent Chinese citizens who can be longtime residents in the US from owning property.
 - What does that sound like? The Exclusion Act but also Alien Land Law - CA led the country in stealing rightfully owned property from millions of immigrants- several hundred thousand of whom across the country were Asian American. So there's a lot of institutional racism at play here
- What works as solutions
 - Civil rights
 - education equity
 - community safety - not simply ambassador programs but ensuring affordable housing, a living wage, something other than slum housing - where people can meet their needs. Obviously Rob talked about the Education Equity side
 - Civil rights
 - With help of AAPI Legislative Caucus- CA leg bills passed SB 1161 - discrimination on public transportation and AB 2448 - addressing discrimination in retail
 - I want to thank the caucus because \$165 million (in grant funding in CA) - hasn't happened in the history of the United States and NY doesn't even come close - Tremendous investment in our communities
 - 19 of 24 of our orgs are AAPI - building our capacity, ensuring comprehensive solutions
 - LA V. Hate - Rick Ang and Robin Toma: those problems are models for our nation - thinking long-term prevention, mental health, bringing our communities together and once and for all addressing and conquering white supremacy

Umemoto: As we have 45 more minutes than we thought, let's go back to the recommendations from Toma and Seay

Toma:

Recommendations:

1. Form a statewide network of local government HRCs and CBOs to build anti-hate infrastructure - some of this has already begun with the Stop Hate network - but we have to recognize this isn't a momentary problem
 - a. Requires long-term commitment
 - b. Human relations community orgs and other local governments, working with and funding community, on a societal, institutional level
 - i. Rick Ang is leading 17 community orgs throughout LA County - existing not only to prevent hate crime but how can we make lasting changes
 - c. Victims and survivors have so much power, people listen to these people and we know that when they step forward, things happen - this is what we want to see throughout our network and statewide network
 - d. CA V Hate (based off of LA V Hate) was just launched - honest truth is that this is a good start but they'll need a lot more resources because there's so many communities that need anti-hate infrastructure
2. Form a commission in collaboration with governments to address overall rise in hate crimes
 - a. Already begun in legislature in CA
 - b. What's missing/needed: collaborating with local governments (city and county) because those are the connections on the ground - within LA county we have connections to department of mental health, sheriff's department, funding to community based organizations, an important element of statewide network

Seay:

3. Support studies on hate crimes to identify preventive actions
 - a. Prosecuted individuals to look at trends in history that could elucidate where interventions could've happened
4. Educate students and the public about Asian Am history and current issue
 - a. Humanize the diverse experience of AAPI
 - b. Deepen cross-ethnic understanding

Toma:

5. Develop mental health programs and reconciliation programs -
 - a. Critical because as we know mental health is an issue in health crimes but also healing for victims and communities is necessary - as we saw from Monterey Park

- b. Recognizing that it sometimes requires healing across communities, we saw this in LA from 1992 to the recently leaked recordings
 - c. Healing strategies beyond material assistance is necessary to recover from hate and feel safe - what's needed in many communities such as West Covina and Rancho Palos Verdes places you wouldn't think are experiencing hate but they're experiencing the harassment that makes many Asian Americans not feel safe
6. Exploring alternative consequences for low-level hate crime offenders
- a. I mentioned earlier that the usual approach is to increase sentencing or make it easier to prosecute people for hate crimes
 - b. We know that putting people in prisons and jails has not been effective in changing recidivism and doesn't improve public safety – our approach to incarceration needs to change and I think that there are more effective approaches:
 - c. Transformative justice based, requires relationships and experiences to connect people
 - i. We know that a lot of people that commit hate crimes are socially isolated
7. Allocating resources to reverse the underreporting of hate incidents and hate crimes
- a. Key to what Stop AAPI Hate is doing - The fact is there haven't been places to call or report it...that's what we're trying to change. We want to tell people if you call we're gonna make a difference and work so it doesn't happen again

Seay:

8. Utilize longitudinal data and tools such as the data dashboard to deepen and broaden public understanding
- a. And also have a place for people to go with initial inquiries
 - b. Toma: Bystander training is very much lacking - Hollaback training is something that everyone needs to participate in because too many people say they were experiencing hate in front of others
 - c. People need to be prepared to thoughtfully and intelligently respond to help our community feel safer and make sure we're not simply watching hate happen

Assemblyman Muratsuchi represents South Bay and Harbor Areas with large AAPI communities in LA Torrance, Gardena, Beach cities, UCLA Law, worked with Robin Toma at ACLU, former JACL regional representative

- I. (Introduced and acknowledgments of other speakers - worked with Robin at ACLU) - I really appreciate this convening of university, government, and community orgs to address recommendations on the screen
- II. I would like to share a timeline of what it was like to be -serving the legislature, how I've dealt with the issue of hate crimes for almost 30 years as...
 - A. JACL regional director - where we were focusing back then on a lot of the approaches to hate crimes in terms of how do we increase sentences to deter hate crime offenders
 - 1. I remember in Little Tokyo there were talks about kobans - community based policing in LT
 - 2. I pay my respects to Robin but I wanted to push back and bring up the role of law enforcement - I think about who do I call when something happens? I call the police. If

our current law enforcement isn't addressing what we need - how do we work *with* them?
I wanted to hopefully have a conversation on that

- B. President Trump stepped up the rhetoric in terms of Anti-Asian bashing, much more a part of the public dialogue
 - 1. Stepped up the rhetoric, he was the one who Repeatedly used Wuhan Virus, China virus, Kung Flu - we saw people throughout the country coming out and seeing a dramatic increase in anti-Asian hate crimes
 - 2. We saw this happening across the country - the most visceral experience was hearing about the Thai gentleman in SF. When I saw him being brutally killed, I thought about my own father... or the woman beaten in NY Chinatown, I thought of my own mother. I think that is the immediate connection we had to this issue → we knew that this was going to be the #1 priority for the AAPI Caucus
 - 3. You heard Manju talking about the >\$165 Million dollars we had to go towards:
- C. Building an Anti-Hate infrastructure
 - 1. Most of the money is going to the community based organizations because most of the caucus came from these orgs and knew that these places are where immigrants go to for support and help
 - a) Of the money, \$10 million is to building an anti-hate infrastructure
 - 2. Introduced a bill to introduce a state-wide hate hotline (coming out of what Manju talked about earlier with relying on local law enforcement to gather the data) with David Chu from SF to try and create a reporting network - not just for the AAPI community...this rise in hate is not limited to the AAPI community - we're seeing it in the Black, Latino, LGBTQ, Jewish, Muslim so we wanted to bolster the state-wide network
 - 3. Original proposal was to build on what currently exists for data gathering through the Attorney justice and the California Department of Justice
 - a) Rob Bonta was just appointed as the Attorney General of CA and we thought what better opportunity than to have a progressive AAPI leading this effort
 - b) Found that organizations didn't want to collaborate with government, concerns with going to DOJ and relying on law enforcement - wanted to build it based off of community orgs - against what was being discussed at the nation-wide level
 - (1) Same time as Grace Meng proposed a bill to target attorney general's offices across the country
 - (2) Concerned with the opportunity to access federal funding but we landed on what we have here
 - (3) If you look up CA Civil Rights Department: CA vs. Hate, you'll see a site set up on not just reporting AAPI hate but all hate crimes
 - (a) California civil rights.ca.gov
 - 4. I think this speaks a lot in terms of the Anti-hate infrastructure - the coordination of local human relations commissions in collaboration with local governments to address the overall rise in crimes

D. If I can jump to #4 that's the long term solution we're looking at:

1. Require ethnic studies as a high school graduation requirement, first year effective is 2027 - time away to make sure
 - a) we have resources like the Multimedia Textbook
 - b) We need more ethnic studies teachers; I hope that some folks here are aspiring ethnic studies teachers
2. Community colleges and CSUs set up an ethnic studies requirement
3. So CA is leading in the fight for ethnic studies despite what we see across the nation, in places like Texas where we see alien land laws –
4. We want, here in CA, want to make sure that all Californians are educated about all the diversity that makes our state great

Umemoto: let's give a round of applause

[Q & A]

Samina M.: Doing a study on Asian women in politics and their experience with violence and harassment. One of my concerns is that I want to make sure that once we're done with our findings is that the organizations that are supporting the candidates are going to get those resources. My impression of a lot of the funding is that most of the funding is going to organizations that are white-led organizations. So my question is how much of this funding is going to those who are a part of our community

Toma: For CA v Hate, one of the things we wanted to make sure is that we funded a network of community-based organizations. We just got the county board of supervisors (all women led govt) to fund about 300k \$ each year for community based organizations - not including another 250k with partnerships of 211 and another quarter of a million for partnerships public education and community engagement orgs. This is an area we hope to grow and we hope to see over time.

Manju: In LA county, we're leading the STOP AAPI hate project and all the orgs, 19/24 are AAPI specific, mostly women, and we're actually expanding that number... mostly women led. We wanna thank Assembly member Muatsuchi and the caucus for making it clear that we are strengthening the capacity of our communities and not going to some of the legacy organizations. Now we have for the first time 3 AAPI women in the caucus, so it's fabulous we're getting more representation there as well.

Julian D. with media services: Ethnic studies legislation was passed two years ago, and everyone understands how important it is especially at K-12 level. Last year we set a report of the implementation. We had [La P] major Spanish news and [] Vietnamese News in OC look at the implementations of the program in OC and LA county.

In OC only Santa Ana county is considering implementation. And in LA county only one district is considering implementation. Even in LA county we've seen a lot of confusion...I think passing legislation is one thing but the follow up is very important because there's a lot of pushback in places like OC and parts of LA county.

Muratsuchi: Thank you so much for that point. There's a lot of talk in Sac of whether and how it's actually implemented in the classroom. So I will follow up on that. I've recently been appointed as the chair of the education committee and I will follow up on that.

Toma: this is a key issue. We had meetings with Karen, Stuart Kwoh, with others in LAUSD leadership because we knew that they were working on it. And we were surprised to see how behind they were. So we're working with schools to work on this. This is a major issue that requires a lot of vigilance and pressure to make that happen.
[1:18:06]

Arlene - LAUSD: Yes, thank you so much, really, really appreciate that. The point about the need for ethnic studies and just about the need for cultural culturally relevant curriculum in our schools. As Karen said I am a Union officer with UTLA. and I am on the utility task force that we put in our contract to push ethnic studies in our school district. Of all the ethnic groups we only had 4 survey questions, up until last year, they actually put in an APIDA course ... We've been way behind but with the new graduation requirement there's a need to not only have the courses but also look at who's teaching and what the qualifications are. Better focus on who's teaching...there's a lot of things we have to do - we're going to have to get our parents and community involved. And, again, I think someone mentioned earlier about organizing, it goes back to organizing, we're gonna have to get more of our parents and community involved. We're gonna have to hit the school board, because we can't do it alone, just trying to get the district and I feel like it's like a bubble bursting and a crisis. That we have before us that this school district hasn't had the infrastructure hasn't done the groundwork. So we've got to do whatever we can to bring it up to speed at this point. So I think, you know, ethnic studies and just not multicultural education, but really teaching a culturally relevant curriculum is really an important piece. and I'm, I'm really glad you mentioned it here as one of the points number four, and I really think it has to be lifted up and I'm really glad that the API, multimedia textbook curriculum, which is has been funded is going to do an enormous, enormous work in in bringing this issue to serve. Thank you.

Ninez from Fielding School of Public Health at UCLA: Thank you so much for this grant, how much is left of 165 million and what can we do to ensure there's continued investment?

Muratsuchi: I don't know how much is left but we're in a big deficit

Ninez P. (Fielding school of Public Health at UCLA): Thank you so much Assembly Member Muratsuchi for the 165, 166 million, how much is left?

Muratsuchi: I don't know.

Ninez: Now that was with a 65 billion surplus, it's gone down even now towards a deficit. What can we do to ensure there's continued investment?

My question is, are these recommendations coming from Asian American victims? Because from working with victims who want their perpetrators behind bars.

Muratsuchi: I think we were \$75 billion in surplus of budget surplus last year. But this year, we're projecting a 22 point 5 billion budget deficit. And so, you know, unfortunately, we are, you know, we know that there's all this important work that needs to be done and needs to be funded. But we are trying to temper people's realistic expectations.

Unknown: So, thank you so much for your very important work. Over the past few years. I've been working a lot directly with Asian American victims of hate and these recommendations like thank you so much for your thoughtful analysis. But my question is, are these recommendations coming from a cross section of the Asian American community and Asian or what Asian American victims want? And I asked you this because I have had victims hold my hand and cry and tell me I want this person who hurt my family who killed my friend, I want this person behind bars. So when you say you don't believe in law enforcement or carceral solutions, I think about those victims who are trying to tell me that that's what they want. So I would like to hear, you know, what sort of where did the recommendations stem from did they come from? I know you're all wonderful educational multimillion dollar institutions, but are they coming from the hearts of victims?

Toma: Thank you for that question. So LA vs Hate actually works directly with victims of hate. They report to us we have care coordinators who reach out to them who ask them the questions that you're talking about what exactly do they need, and we've identified a whole slew of things, many of which are identified here.

Yes, some people want revenge. So we want to put the person who hurt them behind bars. And we're not saying that you never call the police. We're not saying that people don't deserve to be subjected to consequences for their actions. What we're saying is that that can be the major reliance that can be the sole focus or the panacea for this problem. And that tends to be what historically what's been happening, what's happened as the legislative solution or the policy solution. So yes, there is, you know, we understand that we need to address the need for incarceration when that's needed when that actual person's a threat. but to rely on that, which has been historically the case, that's what we're saying needs to change and we don't have those alternatives. We know that if you have other approaches, then you're much more likely to reduce recidivism, you're much more likely to address the root causes of why that person is engaged in violence. And so you can have the law that can prescribe the death penalty for every single hate crime. And I will tell you, it's not going to make hate crimes disappear.

But if we start to talk about education, about mental health, we start to ensure that the person is connected to the community has a circle of support that is pro social and away from white supremacists or the racial organization racist organizations, then you can start to see change, and I think that's what we're saying never have said not to eliminate law enforcement or to eliminate hate crime laws, is to stuff that's been over relied upon.

Muratsuchi: You know, I think at its core, people just want to be safe and to be protected. And you know, I hear what Robin is saying in terms of, you know, in the past Perhaps there's been an exclusive focus on, you know, law enforcement and increasing criminal penalties and so forth. and so I agree with Robin that that we do, we need to, you know, increase, you know, educational activities as well as, you know, mental health support services, you know, trying to address the root causes a lot of these crimes, but, you know, clearly we're at a moment in time now where discussions about criminal justice and criminal justice reform is become highly politicized. I would just say that I believe the solution should be all of the above, then it should be, it should be education, it should be community based anti-hate infrastructure, but we also should have, we need to have law enforcement as part of the solution, rather than as part of the problem.

Manju: So what I wanted to add is, you know, when we analyzed our data and stop API hate and as the nation's leading aggregator of anti API hey we found that of the 11,000+ incidents at 5%, or not even crimes. Right, so that's

why part of what the message is about the limitations of a carceral approach in America if there is a Walmart employee who discriminates against you. We don't want that person behind bars

right. If somebody makes a comment if your professor makes an anti-Chinese come in at you, we don't put that person behind bars, right. So yes, perhaps, you know, those victims may want for the most egregious, right for murder, for rape for you know, other types of significant assault or battery, that can be potentially a solution.

But to the point that Robin made to the state auditor of California in 2018 actually found that there were significant limitations to Hate Crimes Enforcement in California. and there were so many loopholes, there's literally been not one study that has shown that Hate Crimes Enforcement actually prevents future hate crimes, there's not one, you could do a literature review of all the laws in every state in the country, and there's not one study that shows an efficacy.

The last thing I want to say is, I happened to be at the White House for the United Against Hate Summit, where a former White supremacist was interviewed, and they asked him if this was Lisa Ling, the reporter. How do we prevent hate crimes? And you know what his answer was? living wage, affordable housing, good public schools, access to jobs, right. He did not say putting more people behind bars or and these are his former friends and colleagues in the white supremacist. World. He is saying that we need comprehensive solutions, if we're going to prevent it, yes. Now you can prevent secondary harm by individuals if they continue to perpetrate. Hey, but you're gonna do unfortunately, very, very little. And I think that's a common at least that I'm making. you're gonna do very little to change the ecosystem of hate in our country, because most of us again, if we've experiencing, I doubt very few of us have experienced an actual hate crime. So we cannot rely simply on criminal law enforcement. there is also civil law enforcement right where you can get civil penalties, you can get training, you can get mental health services. All of that is there and that's why we need more than just putting people behind bars.

Greg Song: My name is Greg song. I just came from the foreign policy program at Brookings Institution. And so, currently I work at Asian Americans Advancing Justice so both foreign policy and domestic policy, so I apologize, this is a little bit outside the scope, but you know as you were saying with President Trump.

AA Advancing Justice: when Trump came into office every ethnic minority was attacked, it's very likely that he could come into office. Is there anything we can do, in terms of our foreign policy, to put a check or balance on the federal government who engages in that kind of behavior. When he came into office, almost every racial ethnic group in this country has been attacked. It's very possible that he can return to Office, or another similar candidate can take leadership of this country.

So with the pandemic, with the trade war between US and China, and also the spy balloon. And what could very potentially be a conflict between the United States and China. Is there anything that domestically we can do to influence not influence maybe I'd be careful with the word in here but in terms of our foreign policy, if we do go to war with China, Asian American, Asian American spirits will be. I don't know what that will look like. But is there anything currently that the state of California, or Los Angeles a story, is there anything that we can do to perhaps put a check or a balance on the federal government or some kind of President who, you know, engages in that kind of behavior.

Muratsuchi: Well, I would say that I would go back to the long term solution, ultimately being education. You know, I mean, here in California, we're trying to teach people to be proud to be Americans who come from diverse backgrounds, you know, whereas I think Trump's America, you know, Trump supporters, they're saying that

programs like ethics studies are teaching Americans to hate each other. you know, I mean, those are two very different visions of what we want our country to be. And so, you know, I think, over the long term, other than, you know, continuing to constantly emphasize to people that elections matter, and that elections have a direct impact and consequences on our lives. The long term solutions gotta be education.

Manju: So in Stop AAPI Hate, we did a report on scapegoating specifically and looking at what incidents were tied to sort of ethno-nationalism, anti-immigrant sentiment, etc. We saw sort of three different areas and Robin alluded to this. Not only is it public health and COVID, it's also the economy and it's also national security. And what's interesting, specifically about what you said yes, that there is competition with China. They're also national security issues. Isn't it interesting that in this day and age where one of our strong allies is actually at war with Russia there's not any anti-Russian sort of rhetoric or policies right? So that shows you that it is actually racially-based. Russia is doing much more harm to essentially individuals who are you know, to our ally Ukraine, right, and then also, by virtue to any immigrant or US citizens of Ukrainian descent, and yet again, we see the focus being on China.

I would say that we need to hold our politicians accountable for the rhetoric, not allow them to get elected. Sadly, here in California, there *was* a member of Congress who herself, is Asian American, used anti-Chinese rhetoric and sadly won. We need to continue to hold her accountable and know that that can't happen again in the future.

Number two is the policies right? We need to be activated against this Texas ban because if it passes in Texas, it's gonna be up for vote in Virginia, right now Florida, and a number of other states. We also need to hold even democratic elected officials accountable. So under President Biden we unfortunately still have remnants of the China initiative which profiles Chinese American scientists and researchers. We have mass deportations of Southeast Asians, so we cannot abide by those and those feed into what you're saying and talking about. Thank you.

Umemoto: We have two people with questions. Can you both ask your questions and then we just have about four minutes for the panelists to be able to speak to either.

Charlotte _ with ??: studying effects of CA education perpetuating forever foreigner narrative

We have been studying for a little over a year now, the effects. Can you both ask your questions and then we just have about four minutes for a panelist to be able to speak to either, I'm sure.

We have been studying for a little over a year now. The effects of California's education on perpetuating forever foreign narratives, specifically that, that element of it. And my question is that sort of, as we've been looking at him, we see that and we've seen different studies and things showing that most Americans cannot name even a single Asian American hero or history person, not even typically a current person right.

We're looking in the curriculum to see where those things are missing. And my question, kind of is with ethnic studies in the model curriculum. It is aimed at high school students primarily, right and the program which is great, it's a great program not criticizing you that way Definitely. But one of the things in it is also that the districts can choose based on the demographics, which ethnicities they're gonna cover, which obviously in areas that have high concentrations that be something that's covered but it doesn't really solve the problem for the areas where that demographic is important the school district but we still need that in the education.

Also for the younger students, in K through five in particular, we know that race is something that happens, the formation of racial ideas of bullying. It starts a lot younger than high school.

And we're looking at the curriculum there are specific areas, not talking about cultural diversity and other areas. In those sections. You see Asian Americans listed but in the curriculum itself, where it says, mentioned, a US historical figure in kindergarten, they say you talk about American heroes on the list of suggested people. There's never an API person in there. And our perspective is that we can't fix that part of - you will forever be foreign if kids grow up all the way until high school, if people have never seen an Asian American in the story as someone who actually contributed to the US. What is the plan with ethnic studies to sort of continue that or solve that issue of it, especially for younger students where we know that kids are really being hurt?

Umemoto: Ran out of time but this question is relevant to Muratsuchi, but I encourage you to continue this conversation in the hallways.